The aftermath of forced disappearance and concealment: a qualitative study with families in Paine, Chile

Nicolás Morales-Sáez[1,2] and Joel Espina-Sandoval[3]

Key points of interest

- The first-person experience of the relatives of the disappeared makes it possible to account for the subjective and collective dimension of forensic identification.
- Intergenerational relationships are key to studying the impact of forced disappearance.
- Concealment contributes to understanding the enduring intergenerational effects of political repression..

Abstract

Introduction: The forced disappearance of peasants in the commune of Paine, Chile, dates back to the first months after the coup d'état in 1973. Ten years ago, a judicial investigation revealed the location of a mass grave that led to the identification of detainees who had disappeared; eleven using genetic methods, along with another five recognized based on forensic archaeological evidence. Our main objective is to give an account of the consequences of the forced disappearance and concealment in three generations of relatives of disappeared detainees.

Methods: A qualitative case study was conducted between 2014 and 2015, with a total of nineteen interviewees across three generations, belonging to six families in Paine. Semi-structured interviews were conducted, with two to three sessions per interviewee and three focus groups, one for each generation.

Results: There are differences in the way the three generations deal with disappearance and attribute meaning to bone remains. Whereas in the first, generation the »duty to recognize« is prominent, in the second, what dominates is silence, and in the third, the processes of collective grief. In the experiences of intergenerational dialogue, spaces of memory have come to the fore. At last, one of the outstanding results of this investigation has been to give an account of the social experience of forensic identification.

Conclusions: Forced disappearance and the operation of concealment straddle trans-generational effects, among which, voids of representation, silences, and the installation of doubt over the certainty of death stand out. The third generation questions the silences of their predecessors and creates the conditions for intergenerational dialogue, which is expressed

1) Medical Anthropology Research Center, Rovira I Virgili University, Avinguda Catalunya, 35, 43002, Tarragona, Catalonia, Spain
2) San Luis de Buin-Paine Hospital, Arturo Prat 250, Buin, Chile.
Correspondece to: nicolasmoraless@gmail.com
3) Ministry of Health, Mac Iver 541, Santiago, Chile.
Correspondence to: espinajoel@gmail.com

https://doi.org/10.7146/torture.v31i2.121224

International Rehabilitation Council for Torture Victims. All rights reserved.

particularly through collective commemoration rituals. Through DNA analysis, science offers the statistical evidence of forensic identification, but the decision remains in the individual jurisdiction of each family member.

Keywords: Forced disappearance, body remains, exhumation, forensic genetics, intergenerational relations, Chile.

Introduction

This investigation arises from a clinical space - an external unit in a public hospital - dedicated to the care of people who have been recognized as victims of human rights violations by truth commissions in Chile. This space is called PRAIS - an acronym for Program of Reparation and Integral Attention in Health and Human Rights. It is implemented in all the Health Services of the country, "PRAIS Sur« is the corresponding team of the Southern Metropolitan Health Service (SMHS). It covers eleven communes in the southern area of Santiago, including Paine. The authors, who were part of this team, accompanied the families of the disappeared detainees in Paine at different stages linked to the judicial case known as the *Paine Case.*[1]

The investigation seeks to understand the experience of family members during the process of bone-remains identification, carried out following the discovery of a mass grave in which eleven people were identified. They belong to a population of seventy men arrested, executed, and disappeared between September and November 1973 in the commune of Paine (Table 1). Locating the grave, more than 140 km from the place of detention, represents a significant stage in a long and exhausting search, denunciation, and judicial process. Although family members have participated in each of the judicial proceedings relating to the *Paine case*, the overall perception is that they have suffered from a lack of planning in the medical-legal expertise. The support received from professionals from various public institutions and NGOs has been more affective than technical. One of the most strongly associated factors in the search for the truth has been the late revelation of errors in the process of identifying the missing persons identified after the exhumation of the mass grave in *Patio 29* of the General Cemetery between 1993 and 2002 (Bustamante & Ruderer, 2009).

The forensic work in Chile[2] in recent years has allowed the identification of a group of disappeared detainees from biological (bone remains) and cultural evidence (cultural remains[3]) (Table 1). In this paper, we present a summary of our research, giving priority to the main consequences of forced disappearance and concealment as this is experienced by the families and focusing in the trans-gen-

1 Caso Paine is the name of the judicial process Causa Rol Nº4-2002, initiated in 2002 and based in the Court of Appeals of San Miguel, Santiago. The information systematized by the National Institute of Human Rights is available at http://www.indh.cl/

2 For a review of the main background to the work of forensic anthropology and archaeology in the investigation of crimes against humanity in Chile, see: Padilla (1995); Jensen and Cáceres (1995); Madariaga and Brinkmann (2006); Padilla and Reveco (2006); Cáceres (2011); Garrido and Intriago (2012); Intriago, Stockins and Garrido (2015); and Intriago, Uribe and Garrido (2020). For a critical approach see Wyndham and Read (2010); Rosenblatt (2015); and Wagner and Rosenblatt (2017).

3 The cultural remains correspond to personal objects or fragments of them that are recovered in the forensic archaeological work. A description of this work in the mass grave exhumed in Fundo Los Quillayes, including textile fragments discovered in it, can be found in Intriago, Stockins and Garrido (2015).

Table 1. Disappeared detainees and politically executed in Chile and the identification process

	Disappeared Detainees (DD)	Politically Executed	Total	Disappeared Detainees identified[1]	Source
Chile	1109	2118	3337	176	Rettig, CNRR, Valech 2, SML
Patio 29	126	-	126	76[2]	SML
Paine	36	34	70	11[3]	INDH
Paine & Patio 29	11	1	12	3[4]	Rettig, SML, INDH

Authors' own work. Sources: CNRR (Comisión Nacional de Reparación y Reconciliación, 1996); INDH (Instituto Nacional de Derechos Humanos, 2016); Rettig (Comisión Nacional de Verdad y Reconciliación, 1991); SML (Servicio Médico Legal, 2021); Valech 2 (Comisión Asesora Presidencial para la Calificación de Detenidos Desaparecidos, Ejecutados Políticos y Víctimas de Prisión, Política y Tortura, 2011)

1) Information corresponds to DD identified in Chile; another 9 DD have been identified in Argentina by EAAF.
2) Includes three identified persons not qualified by truth commissions.
3) Other 5 DD were identified from cultural evidence (Corte de San Miguel, 2019)
4) Of the 5 DD identified by cultural evidence cited in the previous note, 2 of them are also part of the cases linked to Patio 29.

erational effects. It should be noted that in the study we addressed three specific objectives: grief elaboration, trans-generational effects, and social disaffiliation of families, but in this research paper we only deal with second one.

The analysis has focused on the new "turn" in the field of human rights and transitional justice in recent years: the forensic turn in the investigation of genocide and crimes against humanity.[4] Following Wagner and Kešetović (2016), we are interested in addressing the social experience, both subjective and collective, of relatives of disappeared detainees confronted with forensic evidence.

The commune of Paine is located 42 kilometres south of Santiago and maintains its rural character to this day. Most of the seventy men executed and disappeared under the dictatorship were peasants who had participated in the process of Agrarian Reform in the long 1960s (Maillard & Ochoa, 2014; Weitzel, 2001).

4 Based on the international comparative research programme "Corpses of mass violence and genocide" directed by E. Anstett and J-M. Dreyfus whose first conference was held in 2013, a series of publications is available from Manchester University Press under the name *Human Remains and Violence*, including Anstett and Dreyfus (2015). In addition, a special issue of the journal of the same name, edited by P. Colombo, is dedicated to the forensic turn in Latin America (Colombo, 2016).

Political awareness of the peasant movement in Paine was linked to the processes of unionization, the creation of settlements and land seizures.[5] The specific repression of the peasantry implied not only the extermination of the main local political actors in the Agrarian Reform, but also a process known as the Agrarian Counter-Reform, which consisted of a radical reconcentration of land into the hands of big landowners and was linked to the legal changes introduced by the Chilean dictatorship (Comisión Nacional de Verdad y Reconciliación, 1991; Verdugo, 1990; Villela, 2019).[6]

Memories of violence are part of the daily sociability of several generations of *paininos* through political graffiti, educational talks, public commemorative spaces and social housing projects. The claim of 'national' reconciliation has been opposed to the search for truth and the demand for justice since the early years of the political transition (García-Castro, 2011; Lira & Loveman, 2005; Padilla, 1990). The passing years have sedimented despair and mistrust of the pending justice. An associated phenomenon has been the so-called *biological impunity,* in which the death without criminal sanction of the perpetrators and accomplices, including both civilians and military, is recorded, as well as the death of mothers and wives of the disappeared detainees who saw no compensation for their lives in struggle (Contreras, 2013; Torres, 2014). It was only at the end of 2019 that the Paine Case was sentenced, in which 13 retired members of the Army and *Carabineros* and one civilian were convicted (Corte de San Miguel, 2019).

Forced disappearance and concealment

The forced disappearance of persons constitutes a genocidal practice used by South American dictatorships (Argentina, Bolivia, Brazil, Chile, Uruguay, and Paraguay), among other crimes classified as crimes against humanity by the Rome Statute (Feierstein, 2014). Although the debate on the concept of genocide has developed much less in Chile than in Argentina (Robben, 2012),[7] the questioning of wider society (civilians and military, collaborators and accomplices) mobilises a series of reflections on grieving processes that escape the strictly individual dimension (Robben, 2014). In this sense, as the case of Paine shows, the consequences of forced disappearance in various peasant settlements reveal a set of silences that have operated at multiple levels. These silences reveal processes of concealment of the bodies of disappeared persons; of concealment of the crimes by both civilian and military perpetrators through institutional pacts of silence; of rumours and social stigmas about grieving families; and of family silences that operate above all in trans-generational relations.

The *modus operandi* of forced disappearance acquired common characteristics - at least for the cases of Chile, Argentina, and Uruguay - in which there is a selective character of kidnappings and murders and a particu-

5 "Federación de Asentamientos Área Sur" was a Peasant Federation formed in the Southern Area that did not discriminate based on political affiliation. The following Union Federations were included: "Nuevo Horizonte" from Paine, "Estrella" from Buin, and the "Sargento Candelaria" from the Province of Santiago (Peña, 1973).

6 Decree-Law 208 published in December 1973 annulled Agrarian Reform Law. The collective work mode of the settlement was transformed into small family property and dependence on wage labour (Villela, 2019).

7 One of the few references to the term genocide in the Chilean case is found in economist Andre Gunder Frank's publication in epistolary form addressed to the ideologists of the Chicago School (Frank, 1976).

lar treatment of the bodies of victims of mass crimes (Anstett, 2017, pp. 41-42). According to Anstett, the notion of concealment summarises two relevant actions: the appropriation of victims' bodies and the 'invisibilization' of crimes. In the Chilean case, this concealment was formed through the deployment of an operation called *Retiro de Televisores* in 1978 (Cáceres, 2015). This type of military operation required "logistical support from institutions that were well organized and equipped, such as the army (for the use of telecommunications, means of transport, kidnapping of victims, and treatment of the bodies), along with a rigorous use of secrecy" (Anstett, 2017, p. 43). "*Retiro de Televisores*" was, precisely, a cipher code ("the A-1 Cryptogram") sent from the Commander-in-Chief of the Army to all military divisions to signal the order to exhume and eliminate any trace of the bodies of the disappeared who had previously been buried, either by throwing them into the sea, or by cremating them inside regiments or private enclosures (Cáceres, 2015).

Regarding the arrests of the town of Paine and in the settlements '24 de Abril', 'Nuevo Sendero', and 'El Tránsito', all carried out in the early morning of October 16, 1973[8], the kidnapping could be reconstructed following the testimony of some defendants in the judicial case. Limited by the references provided, despite certain misleading information, the location of the mass grave was made possible by the discovery of a piece of bone and a leather shoe in 2007 (Corte de San Miguel, 2019). The site of the grave is located in the northern sector of Rapel Lake, in Los Arrayanes Ravine, Fundo Los Quillayes (Intriago et al., 2015). As a consequence of the process we have described as concealment, forensic analysis allowed the recovery of only "1175 bone elements and 127 dental elements, disarticulated, mixed and eroded, which, according to anthropological, odontological, and genetic analyses, represent at least thirteen people" (Corte de San Miguel, 2019). Among the anthropological studies, it was concluded that "49 elements present fractures compatible with peri-mortem trauma, caused by firearm projectiles, since they present radial, concentric, and bevel fractures that indicate entry or exit holes" (Corte de San Miguel, 2019). In many cases, the genetic analysis involved the destruction of the bone fragment. Finally, in 2010 and 2011, DNA identification of bone remains confirmed the identity of eleven disappeared detainees,[9] and another five were identified by cultural evidence.[10]

The fragmentation of the bodies of the disappeared, the impossibility of reconstructing the skeletons, the displacement of the site of execution to an unpopulated place more than a hundred kilometers away from where the arrest takes place, and the series of military operations aimed at covering up the crime, all give an account of objectives that seek to transform both the physical and symbolic territory. Achille Mbembe (2019) describes that "space was thus the raw material of sovereignty and of the violence it bears within it" (p. 79). Sovereign power, which Mbembe describes as *necropower*, operates over life and death, and territorializes new spatial relations. In the Chilean and Argentinean cases Antonius Robben, also observes that:

8 With the exception of arrests on the previous days, on October 8 and 10, which were part of the repression in Los Quillayes.

9 The genetic analyses were performed at the Institute for Forensic Medicine of the Innsbruck Medical University (Austria) (Cáceres, 2011).

10 Among the personal objects reported in the forensic survey, the presence of an engagement ring, some glasses, and "318 textile fragments, 120 buttons, zipper sliders and metal rivets, and 6 shirt collar structures" stand out (Corte de San Miguel, 2019).

> *The three principal symbolic meanings of mass graves and anonymous burials mirrored for the Chilean and Argentinian military the Clausewitzean objectives of war: the annihilation of the insurgency and political Left, the reconquest of national territory, and the incapacitation of political agency* (Robben 2015, p. 57).

In this territorial dimension of the mass graves, in the field of sovereignty and necropower, is articulated the symbolic dimension of the impunity of the perpetrators and the impossibility of performing funeral rites. Thus, mass graves "functioned to occult massacres, destroy incriminating evidence, prevent martyrdom, and deny the bereaved relatives their mourning and their dead a proper mortuary ritual" (Robben, 2015, p. 57).

Methodology

The qualitative design followed the structure of a case study. From the beginning of the investigation, we had the participation of the relatives of disappeared detainees, thanks to the collaboration of the *Agrupación de Familiares de Detenidos Desaparecidos y Ejecutados de Paine* (Association of Relatives of the Detained Disappeared and Executed of Paine; AFDD-Paine) and the Paine Memorial Corporation. Theoretical sampling was used to ensure both the heterogeneity of the participants (who were not necessarily active members of the group) and the typological representation of some categories in line with the objectives. For the sample typology, it was assumed that each family comprises a group of individuals who maintain relations of consanguinity or alliance with the missing subject. Since in Paine's case all the disappeared detainees are male, kinship relationships were represented through the following categories:

- Wife: generation 1
- Son or Daughter: generation 2
- Grandson or Granddaughter: generation 3

The participation of one interviewee of at least three generations per family was delimited. In addition to the generational criterion, the typology sought to account for the impact of forensic identification in an intentional way. The selection featured three families that received confirmation of the identification process by the Special Forensic Identification Unit of the Forensic Medical Service and three families where this process has not been completed. At each family we asked to a member of the first generation who suggested and facilitated contact with members of the other generations. The resulting sample size was six families, and nineteen people were interviewed: four men and fifteen women. The composition of the sample is summarised in Table 2, where the gender, relationship, age (for the year 2014 when the interviews are carried out), and in some cases a fictitious name for the location of the interviewees when they are cited in the vignettes, are indicated.

In the first stage of the project, a collection and systematization of archival data was carried out[11], as well as a press review on exhumations and the process of genetic identification. The participants signed an informed consent, with the mediation of a Certifying Officer appointed by the director of the Barros Luco General Hospital, in a protocol previously approved by the SMHS Ethics Committee.

11 Among the sources consulted are the Report of the National Commission of Truth and Reconciliation and documentation from the *Fundación de Documentación y Archivo de la Vicaría de la Solidaridad* (Foundation of Documentation and Archives of the Vicariate of Solidarity).

Table 2. Interviewees in the sample design according to generation and identification process.

	Generation 1	Generation 2	Generation 3
Family member identified	Wife (78) María (wife, 56)[1] Daughter (68) Julia (daughter, 56)	Luisa (daughter, 48) Daughter (42)	Grandson (34) Granddaughter (27) Carmen (granddaughter, 24)
Unidentified family member	Wife (72) Wife (70) Son (63)	José (son, 43) Daughter (42) Sisters (55 and 62)	Granddaughter (32) Granddaughter (23) Grandson (20)

1) María was 15 years old at the time of arrest and is also the daughter of a disappeared detainee.

The information collection phase involved eighteen semi-structured interviews (note that one interview involved two sisters), which were recorded and transcribed. In the interviews the central theme was the identification of bone remains as part of a family process of searching for the truth. Each interview was conducted in two to three sessions with an average of sixty-minutes per session. The interviews were conducted between April 2014 and May 2015. The interviewers were the researchers themselves, who each separately had a research assistant. At a later stage, three focus groups (divided by each generation) were held to address the objective of social disaffiliation of families. The focus groups were held between February and July 2015.

The analysis of the information was carried out through a codification of the data from main thematic categories according to the research objectives. The codification and systematization of the data was carried out with the assistance of a qualitative analysis program (MAXqda). The triangulation of the data was carried out between the interviews and the discussion groups, together with the notes and reports. In addition, four sessions were held by a "technical panel" composed of representatives of the AFDD-Paine, representatives of the AFDD in Santiago, other relatives of disappeared detainees and representatives of the "Martyrs of Paine" group, whose members are the children or grandchildren of disappeared detainees. The aim of the technical round table was to compare the investigation, its progress and results with the critical voice of the population studied through its representatives. In this publication, the SRQR criteria were applied (O'Brien et al., 2014).

Results

The presentation of results has been organised in five interconnected sections where the voices of some participants emerge. The first three sections illustrate how consequences of the disappearance and concealment affect each of the three generations with respect to the search, the meaning attributed to the bone remains, and the recognition process. The last two sections synthesize reflections on intergenerational dialogue and the social experience of forensic identification.

The disappearance question: Where are they?

The banners with the question "*Where are they?*" accompanying the black and white photo of the disappeared have been a symbol of relatives' demands for truth and justice. This slogan has been present throughout the last forty-seven years, spanning at least three generations. The message is sent to society, vindicating the political position of family members of disappeared persons, and, with time, their presence becomes permanent (García-Castro, 2011). Housed in a small format photograph pinned at chest level, it becomes a signifier of the real disappeared person, that historical subject that is no longer there (Orrego, 2013). The symbolic function of the slogan has been sustained in the unanswered question. Even when partial truths about the concealment and fragmentation of the bodies have been revealed, the question remains: Where are the persons beyond the disappeared bodies? Where are the political subjects who challenged to change the world? For Carmen, when she did not yet know the story behind the banner, she remembers that in creating the mosaic of the Paine Memorial,[12] they set out to reproduce the photograph, reflecting "that is the only thing we have tangibly seen of our grandfather," writing around it "your face gives us strength".

The three generations with whom we have carried out the research face the question of *where they are* in a different way. The first generation faces the dilemma of a death without a body, without the possibility of performing the funeral rites (Catela, 1998). Furthermore, this generation has lived constrained by the dispossession of collective networks of protection and sustenance, that is, the dispossession of land in the agrarian counter-reform, as well as the social practices of stigmatisation and discrimination. Some older children have undertaken a search on their own, collecting and handing over records to investigating judges, with no possibility of carrying out these investigations. Other wives have taken the decision to end the search in order to ensure the economic survival of their family group. The latter has also involved older daughters taking on caretaking responsibilities for their younger siblings.

The second generation grew up under the silence and stigma of being the *hijo de* ("child of"). Most were either very young or had not been born at the time of arrest. This generation perceives itself as "neglected", since it does not have the testimonial and/or political protagonism of the first generation. This generation has also had to 'support' and 'accompany' its mothers, but at the same time has not been able to reflect on its own bereavements and has received scarce attention from health teams. José recalls, with regard to the silence:

> *They were always hiding the subject. My mom… with us, with me she didn't talk about it much. She was always kind of quiet. I always remember her crying, always suffering, always working.*

In the third generation, the family silences are challenged by some grandchildren, either in the form of dreams that reveal the truth about the absent grandfather[13] or in the direct ques-

12 The Paine Memorial is a commemorative space located in the town of Paine where the disappearance of the 70 men is represented through a plaque made by each family based on the mosaic technique.

13 Across generations, the presence of the oneiric world has been recounted at critical moments, whether in the relief of the materiality of death, in the enunciation of an ineffable doubt, or as dreams of reunion. In Peru, A. Cecconi (2013)

tioning of the story behind the photograph that is treasured in everyday space. Often, they find the information outside the domestic space, in the same testimonies that their grandmothers have given in interviews with journalists and researchers. Carmen reflects on her relationship with her grandmother:

> *Before, yes, before, maybe they talked and I remember that journalists came, always came to talk to her, to talk to my great-grandmother and they started to go on the 24th[14] […]. There she would talk. So I found it strange that she always talked to these people, but when you asked, there weren't many answers. There were more answers like "yes, yes, no, he's been through this", but more monosyllabic, I don't know, like you couldn't find deeper answers like when I read the Callejón de las Viudas [Widows' Alley] book.*

Meanings of Bone Remains

Gatti (2014) includes forensic work in the "narrative of meaning" (p. 13), and characterises forensic anthropologists as "modern-day heroes striving to restore meaning where meaning has been erased" (p. 64). From interviewed relatives' view bone remains have dissimilar meanings and are embedded in memories of previous identifications and misidentifications (Wyndham & Read, 2010).

For the first generation, the bone remains meaning is determined by the long waiting time and search for relatives. The bone remains bear the historical burden of the repression experienced by them and by the missing relatives. This burden is expressed in the individual imperative of closing a process of suffering. The bone remains are a limited and fragile representation of the body and the person of the disappeared. Their recovery helps to generate in relatives the feeling of the end of the search and waiting stage, and allows the elaboration of a place for death, "a place to put flowers". For María, who received the identification of her husband, but not that of her father, also disappeared, "the only thing that has changed is that one has a place to leave just one flower", "one thought that one was going to receive the whole skeleton. But you don't."

For the second generation, the bone remains represent the materiality of death. This generation grew up surrounded by stories of detention in which the figure of the father is blurred. This absence can be described more as a void than a loss (Castillo, 2000). The family's fear of causing pain to their children explains the lack of an account of the person who disappeared, in a context of impunity and stigmatisation.

For this generation, the bone remains are the proof of death as a logical end to the story of detention and repression. This evidence not only brings back the disappeared, but also the woman (mother/grandmother) who was absent for many years.

The story of the second generation has been built on the self-sufficiency (self-reliance) and accompaniment role of the first generation, usually without taking over their pending grieving process. In Luisa's case, the grief process was linked to a dream that occurred after the identification process: "then I had the dream that my father said 'we are all

---

gives an account of the oneiric manifestations that have preceded the exhumations in Peru, in the context of the relationship between the living and the dead in the Andean communities. Pérez-Sales, Bacic and Durán (1998) have also described "dreams of reunion" in relatives of the disappeared in Araucania.

14 It refers to the place of detention known as El Callejón de las Viudas, formerly the "24 de Abril" settlement.

well', so I said: 'my father is well, he is happy, my father is not bad'".

In the case of the third generation, the bone remains are an imprint of the raw, unrelenting violence exerted on the missing person. This generation has had to observe the incomplete mourning and has lived the individual experience of inheriting a fragmented discourse around the disappeared. It inherits a subject dispossessed of everyday and political dimensions, exalted around kindness and innocence in narratives characterized by voids and silences (Rojas, 2009, p. 183). This generation has built itself between the distance of the facts of suffering (detention and repression) and the account of the demand for truth and justice of its predecessors. In this regard, Carmen points out:

> *(about the grief) is part of an important rite and that if it is not closed it leaves an open process. It is always remembered for the '16th of October' that many of the ladies have died. For example, my grandmother and my great-grandmother died, my grandmother waiting to find her husband and my great-grandmother her son. So, these are processes that do not close, and that leave that wound that makes the silence continue and be maintained; that a discourse cannot be formed, and that history cannot be transmitted; that this is always lived as a personal grief and that it is not seen as at the level of a history that affects the whole family.*

The duty to recognize

The families of the disappeared have been confronted at various times in recent history with the possibility of closure of the process both individually and collectively. At an individual and family level, the postponement of projects, the detention of biographical time due to the liminal statute of disappearance (Regueiro, 2011) have led some relatives to acknowledge the presumed death. At the community and social level, demand is expressed in the inclusion within the community under the identity of "relative of the disappeared" and the stigma that this condition has caused. At the political level, this demand is located in the calls for amnesty for the crimes, as well as the truths agreed upon without justice represented by the narratives of the Truth and Reconciliation Reports (Crenzel, 2009) or the Dialogue Table (Bakiner, 2010)

For the first generation, the "duty to recognize" is an imperative that has been expressed in the recognition of the skeletons (including for those who were first misidentified in the case of *Patio 29*)[15], in the recognition of the bone remains and cultural vestiges, and in the acceptance with objections of the genetic analysis reports. The scientific scene of a skeletal identification is the moment when the truth of the death crystallizes before the relatives. Few images can account for this scene in such a direct and respectful way as those we see in Silvio Caiozzi's documentary, *Fernando ha vuelto* (1998). In 2006, the same director reported, after the official recognition that the human remains correspond to another disappeared person, that the documentary was still in force as a testimony of an era (Caiozzi, 2006). This is what Ferrándiz (2014) suggests as the "scientific scenography" of the mass

15 In addition to the devastating effects of the "second disappearance" caused by misidentifications, the concealment of information by several governments underwent during the transition to democracy meant that the very institutions that were supposed to ensure the return of the missing family member denied critical reports and continued to employ methods that international experts pointed out as questionable (Bustamante & Ruderer, 2009; Rosenblatt, 2015; Wagner & Rosenblatt, 2017).

grave, by presenting the forensic evidence of the traces of political violence on the body. Unlike the skeleton, to which it is possible to superimpose a photograph on a skull and face image in classical forensic methods, the bone remains are a fragment of a history of concealment, a silent witness to the horror.

The second generation silently contemplates how this duty to recognize is instilled in the family. The third generation questions the positions regarding the duty to recognize of previous generations who have sought to give course to the need to continue life, resolve pain, and process grief. This need for recognition is embedded in a process of collective grief, marked by public funeral rituals and tribute ceremonies with the participation of public officials and political leaders.

The intergenerational dialogue

The possibilities of intergenerational dialogue within families have been limited to some specific circumstances, such as the elaboration of the mosaics that are part of the Paine Memorial or the annual commemorative activity that takes place at the Fundo Los Quillayes every October 16th. Bustamante (2014, p. 287) points out that the mosaics of the Paine Memorial make up a memory device that operates through the remembrance of what has disappeared (the relative), the transmission of historical facts embodied in a particular iconography that provides key data on the history of violence in Paine, and the vindication of the victims' humanity by illustrating their family and work context. Likewise, for Hite (2013, pp. 94-126), the intergenerational elaboration of the Memorial contributes to a post-nostalgic memory thanks to the social and educational work carried out by the grandchildren, the third generation.

However, in our research experience we have found that the Memorial has not been appropriated by generations of children and grandchildren of the disappeared, except for those directly involved in the management of this site of conscience. The interviewees remember with emotion the instance of collective elaboration of the mosaic, but this commemorative work has not been prolonged in a continuous use of space. Nevertheless, the work of memory that has been carried out since the management of the Memorial has allowed for the socialization of the memory of the disappearance through workshops and guided visits to students of the commune. We consider that this lack of appropriation of the space by the families reflects the difficulties in breaking the family silences sustained for decades, as well as the frustration, distrust, and anger generated by the impunity and the coexistence with the civil perpetrators.

On the other hand, the ravine in the Fundo Los Quillayes condenses the scene of the execution of the detainees on the morning of October 16, 1973. After the discovery of the clandestine grave, an annual commemoration is held in which the AFDD-Paine and, in recent years, the *Agrupación de Derechos Humanos Mártires de Paine* (Martyrs of Paine Human Rights Association), created by the grandchildren of disappeared persons in Paine, participate. The trip from Paine to both the place of memory and the commemorative event held in the open space beside the ravine, have a profound meaning for the families who come there year after year. There, families whose relatives have been identified by the bone or cultural evidence found in the mass grave, as well as those who have not, come together. The relevance of the site of Los Quillayes is associated to the fact of knowing, in the words of Julia, that "it is the last place where they were alive, in that place they were shot, and their blood was consumed in that land".

The social experience of forensic identification

The social experience of forensic identification has generated unprecedented socio-cultural responses in the collective elaboration of grief (Robin-Azevedo, 2015, p. 77). In Chile, since the discovery of the mass grave in the *Hornos de Lonquén* in 1978, the appearance of skeletons has contributed to the hope of finding the bodies of the disappeared, while at the same time it has triggered the beginning of the operation of concealment (Cáceres, 2011). In the words of Calveiro (1998), it is a two-pronged form of power that conceals and makes disappear, but at the same time leaves evidence of the 'open secret' of horror. In this way, those disappeared who challenge the world with their tales of terror direct the exemplary message of what can "happen again, we must know how to behave". In Paine, this situation has been re-edited with the most recent social conflicts. For example, during the "truckers' strike" in 2015, the possibility of "returning to 73" was symbolically installed.

With the passage of time, the possibility of finding bodies decreases, and so does the possibility of finding them as 'bodies'. The most real possibility is to find 'remains'; fragments that not only evidence deterioration over time and the conditions of burial, but also evidence the cruelty of the perpetrators who, after arrest and murder, return in their own footsteps and the traces of their crimes disappear.

The policy of concealment developed by the dictatorship, added to errors of identification in the case of Patio 29 in the midst of political transition, disqualified the recognition of the other by the gaze (traditional forensic methods). The certainty created by the participation of families in the recognition of skeletons must have given way to a search through genetic identification. The DNA method allows the family member to accept or reject the authorised word of the forensic expert. This is how the relatives were placed in the complex position of 'having to decide the death of the other'[16]. Doubt is instilled in the decision to trust the discourse of science and authority. It is no longer the subject himself who ascertains the death, but he must believe in the word of the expert. It is a cognitive operation that reconstructs the materiality of the rest with the identity of the disappeared person in whose interstices doubt slips (Gatti, 2008; Robin-Azevedo, 2015, p. 85). In the face of this doubt, cultural remains, such as the "sole of a shoe", take on greater relevance than the DNA analysis report itself. This report is questioned on its degree of reliability: "can you tell me that it is one hundred percent?", to which forensic science responds with "a percentage of 99.95" (Wagner, 2008, p. 115). Except for the glasses recovered few objects have "returned home" (Bustamante, 2014). However, the story they evoke allows us to reconstruct traces of significant family memories based on the recognition of a piece of trousers, a particular form of belt loop, or the handcrafted making of an *ojota*[17].

Conclusions

Forced disappearance and the operation of concealment straddle trans-generational effects. Necropolitics translates at the local

16 Wagner and Kešetović point out that the official identification process of missing persons from Srebrenica requires the acceptance of identification by a designated next of kin. Since in the described case the finding of bone remains in different secondary graves could occur, it used to happen that some families postponed the decision in the hope of finding additional remains (2016, p. 47)

17 Sandal used by the peasant class, with a tire sole and leather straps. Its name derives from the Quechua term *usuta* (Pacheco, 2000).

level as a stigmatised family history, and to the mobilisation of the generation of wives and older children towards public denunciation, registering the pending grief as a private phenomenon.

Inwardly, family relationships do not transmit an integrating story but rather what stands out is the void of representation and the intergenerational silences. The second generation, due to its proximity to the origin of the facts, can be considered as traumatised just like the first generation. And although it has been accompanied by mental health professionals, his enduring silence suggests further studies on this issue.

The third generation tries to recover the history of the grandparents from a position that questions the necropower and questions the silences of the first and second generation. The social memory is reworked based on the possibility of an intergenerational dialogue that is sustained, among other mechanisms, by collective rituals of commemoration. Among them, the visit to Fundo Los Quillayes' ravine every October 16th stands out, summoning all the families, not only those who received a genetic identification.

Another trans-generational effect of concealment is the installation of the doubt of the certainty of death. Science, through DNA, provides the statistical evidence, but the decision remains in the individual jurisdiction of each family member. As Wagner and Kešetović (2016) point out, the participation of families in the forensic process is key to achieving identification. However, the experience of errors in identification of the bodies exhumed from *Patio 29* still undermines confidence in Paine's families. The judicial conviction has come unfortunately too late for many family members, mainly wives and mothers already dead. Nevertheless, the social experience of forensic identification has mobilised collective grieving efforts and the voices of the new generations augur well for a *relay* in the lives of the struggle.

Acknowledgements

We thank research assistants Jorge Fischer and Javier Castro for their enthusiastic collaboration in the preparation, recording and subsequent transcription of interviews and focus groups.

References

Anstett, E. (2017). Comparación no es razón: A propósito de la exportación de las nociones de Desaparición forzada y detenidos desaparecidos [Comparison is not reason: About the export of the notions of enforced disappearance and disappeared detainees]. In G. Gatti (Ed.), *Desapariciones. Usos locales, circulaciones globales* [Disappearances. Local uses, global circulations] (pp. 33-51). Bogotá: Siglo del Hombre Editores.

Anstett, E., & Dreyfus, J-M. (2015). *Human remains and identification: Mass violence, genocide, and the 'forensic turn'*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Bakiner, O. (2010). From denial to reluctant dialogue: The Chilean military's confrontation with human rights (1990–2006). *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 4 (1), 47-66. doi:10.1093/ijtj/ijp025

Bustamante, J. (2014). *Las voces de los objetos. Vestigios, memorias y patrimonios en la gestión y conmemoración del pasado* [The voices of objects. Vestiges, memories and heritages in the management and commemoration of the past] (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). University of Barcelona, Barcelona, Spain.

Bustamante J., & Ruderer, S. (2009). *Patio 29: Tras la cruz de fierro* [Courtyard 29: Behind the iron cross]. Santiago: Ocho Libros Editores.

Cáceres, I. (2011). *Detenidos desaparecidos en Chile: Arqueología de la muerte negada* [Disappeared in Chile: Archaeology of the denied death]. (Unpublished bachelor's dissertation). University of Chile, Santiago, Chile.

Cáceres, I. (2015). La remoción de sitios de violencia política: la operación "Retiro de Televisores" [The removal of sites of political violence: Operation "Television Withdrawal"]. *Actas del XIX Congreso Nacional de Arqueología Chilena*. Arica: University of Tarapacá, pp. 287-291.

Caiozzi, S. (1998). *Fernando ha vuelto* [Fernando is

back] [Motion picture]. Chile: Andrea Films.
Caiozzi, S. (2006). *¿Fernando ha vuelto a desaparecer?* [Has Fernando disappeared again?] [DVD]. Chile: Andrea Films.
Calveiro, P. (1998). *Poder y desaparición: Los campos de concentración en la Argentina* [Power and disappearance: Concentration camps in Argentina]. Buenos Aires: Colihue.
Castillo, M. I. (2000). El proceso de duelo de los familiares de detenidos desaparecidos - 27 años después [The mourning process of the relatives of disappeared detainees - 27 years later]. *Revista ILAS - Instituto Latinoamericano de Salud Mental y Derechos Humanos* 2 (2), 70-78.
Catela, L. D. S. (1998). Sin cuerpo, sin tumba. Memorias sobre una muerte inconclusa [No body, no grave. Memoirs of an unfinished death]. *Historia, Antropología y Fuentes Orales* 20, 87-104.
Cecconi, A. (2013). Cuando las almas cuentan la guerra. Sueños, apariciones y visitas de los desaparecidos en la región de Ayacucho [When souls tell the war. Dreams, apparitions and visits of the disappeared in the Ayacucho region]. In P. del Pino y C. Yezer (Eds.), *Las formas del recuerdo: Etnografías de la violencia política en el Perú* [The forms of memory: Ethnographies of political violence in Peru]. Lima: IEP, IFEA.
Colombo, P. (2016). Editorial. Exhumations in Latin America. *Human Remains and Violence* 2 (2), 1-2. doi:10.7227/HRV.2.2.1
Comisión Asesora Presidencial para la Calificación de Detenidos Desaparecidos, Ejecutados Políticos y Víctimas de Prisión, Política y Tortura (2011). *Informe y Nómina de Personas Reconocidas como Víctimas en la Comisión Asesora Presidencial para la Calificación de Detenidos Desaparecidos, Ejecutados Políticos y Víctimas de Prisión, Política y Tortura (Valech II)* [Report and List of Persons Recognised as Victims in the Presidential Advisory Commission for the Qualification of Disappeared Detainees, Politically Executed and Victims of Prison, Politics and Torture (Valech II)]. Retrieved from http://bibliotecadigital.indh.cl/handle/123456789/600
Comisión Nacional de Reparación y Reconciliación (1996). *Informe sobre calificación de víctimas de violaciones de derechos humanos y de la violencia política* [Report on qualification of victims of human rights violations and political violence]. Santiago: Andros impresores.
Comisión Nacional de Verdad y Reconciliación (1991). *Informe de la Comisión Nacional de Verdad y Reconciliación (Vol. 1)* [Report of the National Truth and Reconciliation Commission (Vol. 1)]. Santiago: La Nación.
Contreras, R. (2013). *El caso Paine* [Paine case] [Motion picture]. Chile: Poder Judicial. Retrieved from http://cinechile.cl/pelicula/el-caso-paine/
Corte de San Miguel (2019). *Sentencia de la Corte de Apelaciones de San Miguel* [San Miguel Court of Appeals Ruling], Case Rol 4-2002, October 29, 2019. Retrieved from: www.diarioconstitucional.cl
Crenzel, E.(2009). Los derechos humanos y las políticas de la memoria: Reflexiones a partir de las experiencias de las comisiones de la verdad en Argentina y Chile [Human rights and the politics of memory: Reflections on the experiences of truth commissions in Argentina and Chile]. In R.Vinyes (Ed.), *El Estado y la memoria: Gobiernos y ciudadanos frente a los traumas de la historia* [The State and the memory: Governments and citizens facing the traumas of history] (pp. 357-370). Barcelona: RBA Libros.
Feierstein, D. (2014.) *Genocide as social practice: Reorganizing society under the Nazis and Argentina's military juntas.* London: Rutgers University Press.
Ferrándiz, F. (2014). *El pasado bajo tierra. Exhumaciones contemporáneas de la Guerra Civil* [The past underground. Contemporary exhumations of the Civil War]. Madrid: Anthropos.
Frank, A. G. (1976). Economic genocide in Chile: Open letter to Milton Friedman and Arnold Harberger. *Economic and Political Weekly* 11 (24), 880-888.
García-Castro, A. (2011). *La muerte lenta de los desaparecidos en Chile* [The slow death of the disappeared in Chile]. Santiago: Cuarto Propio.
Garrido, C., & Intriago, M. (2012). Managing commingled remains from mass graves: Considerations, implications and recommendations from a human rights case in Chile. *Forensic Science International* 219, e19-e24. doi:10.1016/j.forsciint.2011.11.035
Gatti, G. (2008). Moral techniques. Forensic anthropology and its artifacts for doing good. *Sociología y Tecnociencia* 3 (1), 12-31.
Gatti, G. (2014). *Surviving forced disappearance in Argentina and Uruguay: Identity and meaning*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.
Hite, K. (2013). *Política y arte de la conmemoración: Memoriales en América Latina y España* [The Politics and art of commemoration: Memorials in Latin America and Spain]. Santiago: Mandrágora.
Instituto Nacional de Derechos Humanos (2016). *Base de datos Paine* [data set]. Retrieved from http://bibliotecadigital.indh.cl/handle/12345678

9/978

Intriago, M., Stockins, J., & Garrido, C. (2015). Forensic archaeology in Chile: The contribution of the Chilean State to our memory, truth and justice. In W. F. M. Groen, N. Márquez-Grant y R. Janaway (Eds.), *Forensic archeology. A global perspective* (pp. 389-397). Oxford: Wiley.

Intriago, M., Uribe, V., & Garrido, C. (2020). The Chilean experience in forensic identification of human remains. In R. Parra, S. Zapico y D. Ubelaker (Eds.), Forensic *science and humanitarian action: Interacting with the dead and the living* (pp. 703-714). Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons.

Jensen, K., & Cáceres, I. (1995). El peritaje antropológico forense en relación con la problemática de los detenidos desaparecidos y los ejecutados políticos. La experiencia del Grupo Chileno de Antropología Forense (GAF) [Forensic anthropological expertise in relation to the problem of the disappeared and the politically executed. The experience of the Chilean Forensic Anthropology Group]. A*ctas del II Congreso Chileno de Antropología* (pp. 137-141). Valdivia: Colegio de Antropólogos de Chile.

Lira, E., & Loveman, B. (2005). *Políticas de reparación: Chile 1990-2004* [Reparation policies: Chile 1990-2004]. Santiago: Lom.

Madariaga, C., & Brinkmann, B. (2007). Identidad y retraumatización. Particularidades del proceso de exhumaciones vivido en Chile desde la mirada de un organismo de Derechos Humanos [Identity and re-traumatisation. Particularities of the exhumation process in Chile from the point of view of a Human Rights organisation]. In P. Pérez-Sales y S. Navarro (Eds.), *Resistencias contra el olvido. Trabajo psicosocial en procesos de exhumaciones en América Latina* [Resistances against forgetting. Psychosocial work in exhumation processes in Latin America] (pp. 123-139). Barcelona: Gedisa.

Maillard, C., & Ochoa, G. (2014). *Yo soy… Mujeres familiares de detenidos desaparecidos y ejecutados de Paine* [I am... Women relatives of disappeared and executed detainees from Paine]. Santiago: Andros Impresores.

Mbembe, A. (2019). *Necropolitics*. Durham: Duke University Press

O'Brien, B. C., Harris, I. B., Beckman, T. J., Reed, D. A, & Cook, D. A. (2014). Standards for reporting qualitative research: A synthesis of recommendations. *Acad Med.* 89 (9), 1245-1251. doi:10.1097/ACM.0000000000000388

Orrego, P. (2013). *Fotografía, historia y memoria. Presencia de una ausencia: La fotografía de los detenidos desaparecidos en cuatro momentos* [Photography, history and memory. Presence of an absence: The photography of the disappeared detainees in four moments] (Unpublished master's dissertation). Catholic University of Chile, Santiago, Chile.

Pacheco, A. (2000). *Diccionario quechua-castellano, castellano-quechua, inglés-quechua* [Quechua-Spanish, Spanish-Quechua, English-Quechua Dictionary]. Santiago: Ediciones Madrigal.

Padilla, E. (1995). *La memoria y el olvido. Detenidos desaparecidos en Chile* [Memory and forgetting. Detainees disappeared in Chile]. Santiago: Ediciones Orígenes.

Padilla, E., & Reveco, I. (2006). Memorias del Grupo de Antropología Forense y su Aporte al Campo de los Derechos Humanos en Chile [Memoirs of the Forensic Anthropology Group and its contribution to the field of Human Rights in Chile]. In Colegio de Antropólogos de Chile, *Actas V Congreso Chileno de Antropología* (pp. 1100-1108). Santiago: LOM.

Peña, A. (1973). "Tenemos que aprender a mandarnos solos, sin patrón" ["We have to learn to be in charge of ourselves, without a boss"]. *Revista Agraria, (Supplement to Revista Chile Hoy)* 5, pp 7 and 12.

Pérez-Sales, P., Bacic, R., & Durán, T. (1998). *Muerte y desaparición forzada en la Araucanía: Una perspectiva étnica* [Death and enforced disappearance in Araucanía: An ethnic perspective]. Temuco: Ediciones Universidad Católica de Temuco.

Regueiro, S. (2011). Familia y desaparición. Implicancias simbólicas de la desaparición en la familia [Family and disappearance. Symbolic implications of disappearance in the family]. In C. Hidalgo (Comp.), *Etnografías de la muerte: Rituales, desapariciones, VIH/SIDA y resignificación de la vida* [Ethnographies of death: Rituals, disappearances, HIV/AIDS and the resignification of life] (pp. 43-82). Buenos Aires: CICCUS, CLACSO.

Robben, A. (2012). From dirty war to genocide: Argentina's resistance to national reconciliation. *Memory Studies* 5 (3), 305-315. doi:10.1177/1750698012443887

Robben, A. (2014). Massive violent death and contested national mourning in post-authoritarian Chile and Argentina: A sociocultural application of the dual process model. *Death Studies* 38 (5), 335-345. doi:10.1080/07481187.2013.766653

Robben, A. (2015). Exhumations, territoriality and necropolitics in Chile and Argentina. In F.

Ferrándiz and A. Robben (Eds.), *Necropolitics: Mass graves and exhumations in the age of Human Rights* (pp. 53-75). Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
Robin-Azevedo, V. (2015). D'os, d'habits et de cendres: Corps exhumés et reconfiguration des dispositifs rituels et symboliques dans le Pérou post-conflit. *Revue Européenne des Sciences Sociales* 53 (2), 75-98. doi:10.4000/ress.3284
Rojas, P. (2009). *La interminable ausencia: Estudio médico, psicológico y político de la desaparición forzada de persona*s [The Interminable absence: A medical, psychological and political study of the forced disappearance of persons]. Santiago: Lom.
Rosenblatt, A. (2015). *Digging for the Disappeared: Forensic science after atrocity*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
Servicio Médico Legal (2021). *Listado de víctimas de violación a los DD.HH. identificadas a la fecha* [List of victims of Human Rights violations identified to date]. Retrieved from https://www.sml.gob.cl/index.php/2021/05/listado-de-victimas-de-violacion-a-los-dd-hh-identificadas-a-la-fecha/
Torres, I. (2014). El rol del Servicio Médico Legal (SML) en la identificación de los detenidos desaparecidos en Chile [The role of the Forensic Medical Service in the identification of disappeared detainees in Chile]. *Estudios (Centro de Estudios Avanzados)* 31, 157-180.
Verdugo, P. (1990). *Tiempo de días claros* [Clear weather]. Santiago: CESOC Ediciones Chile-América.
Villela, H. (2019). *Saqueo y exterminio de la clase campesina. La Contra Reforma del régimen civil y militar, 1973-1976* [Pillage and extermination of the peasant class. The counter-reform of the civilian and military regime, 1973-1976.]. Santiago: Lom.
Wagner, S. (2008). *To know where he lies. DNA technology and the search for Srebrenica's missing*. California: University University Press.
Wagner, S., & Kešetović, R. (2016). Absent bodies, absent knowledge: The forensic work of identifying Srebrenica's missing and the social experiences of families. In D. Congram (Ed.), *Missing Persons: Multidisciplinary perspectives and methods on finding the Disappeared* (pp. 42-59). Toronto: Canadian Scholars Press.
Wagner, S., & Rosenblatt, A. (2017). Known unknowns: DNA identifications, the Nation-state, and the iconic dead. In C. Stojanowski and W. Duncan (Eds.), *Case studies in Forensic Biohistory: Anthropological perspectives* (pp. 237-266). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
Wyndham, M., & Read, P. (2010). From State terrorism to State errorism. Post-Pinochet Chile's long search for truth and justice. *The Public Historian* 32 (1), 31-44. doi:10.1525/tph.2010.32.1.31.
Weitzel, R. (2001). *El callejón de las viudas* [Widows' Alley]. Santiago: Planeta.

Funding
The project 'Effects of the Process of Recognition of Bone Remains and Identification of Disappeared Detainees on the Subjectivity of Their Relatives in a Rural Community. The case of Paine' received funding from FONIS-CONICYT (Grant SA13I20075).

Supplementary material
Spanish version of this paper is available in the Torture Journal website: https://tidsskrift.dk/torture-journal/issue/archive